



MEMO

TO: Heather McColl, Tim Gilligan, Rubab Nadeem
FROM: Eve Stencel, P. Eng.
SUBJECT: Colborne Water Treatment Plant Electrical & SCADA System Upgrades - Tender Recommendation
DATE: May 9, 2025

WSP is pleased to submit herein our analysis and recommendations to the Tenders received for the Colborne Water Treatment Plant Electrical & SCADA System Upgrades request (2025-01).

INTRODUCTION

Tender documents (drawings and specifications) were issued to contractors who attended the April 1, 2025, site visit.

The planned upgrades include replacement of the Motor Control Center, Variable Frequency Drive for well pump #2, and instrumentation control panel in the main building as well as replacement of the PLC at the Colborne Standpipe.

TENDERING PROCESS

The Corporation of the Township of Cramahe published a tender for Contractors on March 24, 2025, with an original closing date of April 10, 2025. The tender closed on May 1, 2025.

There were two (2) tender closing extensions issued with Addendum No. 1 and Addendum No. 4. There were five (5) addendums in total.

WSP was the Township's representative during the Tender process and as such fielded all contractor inquiries. The question period ran from the time of Tender issued until April 24, 2025. The questions received during this period were answered in the five (5) addendums.

EVALUATION OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Contractors Evaluated: Selectra Inc. & Ferguson Electric Company Limited

1. Technical Expertise & Experience

Both Selectra Inc. and Ferguson Electric Company Limited have demonstrated technical expertise and experience in municipal projects. Their past performance suggests they are capable of completing the required work to the expected standards.

2. Compliance with Tender Requirements

Selectra Inc. submitted the lowest bid but failed to include Tender Form TF-8, a required document in the tender submission.

Ferguson Electric Company Limited submitted a higher bid but included all required forms, ensuring full compliance with the tendering process.

3. Procurement Policy Considerations

According to the Township of Cramahe's procurement policies, adherence to submission requirements is a key factor in evaluating bids. The policy emphasizes transparency, fairness, and compliance in the procurement process. Given that Selectra Inc. did not submit all required documents, their bid may be considered non-compliant, potentially disqualifying them from consideration.

4. Risk Assessment

Accepting Selectra Inc.'s bid may pose administrative and contractual risks due to incomplete documentation.

Ferguson Electric Company Limited's bid, while higher, ensures compliance and reduces the likelihood of procedural complications.

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

The Township received two (2) bids on May 1, 2025, from the following Contractors:

- Ferguson Electric Company Limited
- Selectra Inc.

The tender prices submitted by the Contractors are summarized in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Summary of Tender Prices

	Ferguson Electric Company	Selectra Inc.
Division 1 Items (General)	\$52,000.00	
Division 13 Items (I&C)	\$ 130,000.00	
Division 16 Items (Elec.)	\$ 206,000.00	
Provisional Items	\$10,000.00	
Total (excludes HST)	\$ 398,000.00	\$ 334,036.18

The lowest bid was submitted by Selectra Inc. in the amount of \$ 334,036.18 (Excludes HST).

The bid supplied by Selectra Inc. is approximately 16%¹ less than the Ferguson Electric Company Limited bid that was submitted. The bid submitted by Selectra Inc. did not include Tender Form TF-8 as part of their tender submission and therefore, the breakdown of the total lump sum tender price is not known, and it is not possible to evaluate if the breakdown of the lump sum price submitted by Selectra is balanced. The bid submitted by Ferguson Electric Company is sufficiently balanced. The tender prices submitted by both companies are below the estimated cost prepared by WSP.

¹ Excludes the HST

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the evaluation, Ferguson Electric Company Limited is recommended for contract award due to their full compliance with tender requirements and alignment with the Township of Cramahe's procurement policies. While Selectra Inc. offered a lower bid, their failure to submit Tender Form TF-8 presents a risk that may not align with the municipality's procurement standards. However, WSP would like to refer this tender analysis to the Township of Cramahe Procurement Department, should they wish to take a different approach from the one outlined above. This would ensure a thorough review of the procurement process and allow for any policy-based alternative considerations.

Please call or email should you require additional clarification.

Thank you,



Eve Stencil, P.Eng.
Project Manager

